

PLANNING COMMITTEE



Application Address	1 & 6 Hurn Court Hurn Court Lane Christchurch BH23 6BH
Proposal	Replacement of decayed coping brickwork with new coping stones above flat 6 and flat 1 (retrospective applications).
Application Numbers	8/21/0131/FUL & 8/21/0132/LB
Applicant	Mrs F Cox
Agent	Mr Ryan Barnett
Date Application Valid	15 February 2021
Decision Due Date	12 April 2021
Extension of Time Date (if applicable)	23 July 2021
Ward	Commons
Report status	Public
Meeting date	22 July 2021
Recommendation	Grant subject to conditions which are subject to alteration/addition by the Head of Planning Services provided any alteration/addition does not go to the core of the decision.
Reason for Referral to Planning Committee	Applicant is spouse of elected Member, Cllr Cox.
Case Officer	Melanie Smith

Description of Development

1. Replacement of decayed coping brickwork with new coping stones above flat 6 and flat 1 to the south elevation.
2. The coping is sited on top of the parapets at roof level. As Hurn Court is a grade II* listed building and in use as self-contained flats, and the works cannot be

deemed a repair, both listed building consent and full planning permission is required.

3. Key Issues

- Impact upon significance of listed building
- Impact on neighbouring living conditions

4. Planning Policies

5. Development Plan:

Christchurch and East Dorset Local Plan - Core Strategy (2014)

KS1 Presumption in favour of sustainable development

HE1 Valuing and Conserving our Historic Environment

HE2 Design of new development

Christchurch Borough Council Local Plan (2001) Saved Policies

H12 Residential Infill

BE 14 Alterations to Listed Building

Relevant Planning Applications and Appeals

8/20/0477/FUL	1 Hurn Court Hurn Court Lane Christchurch BH23 6BH	Repair and replacement of three timber structures on Hurn Court, (an oriel window, atrium and cupola), undertake external repairs and replacement of three chimneys, due to decay and deterioration (amended description).	Granted	02/11/20
8/20/0478/LB	1 Hurn Court Hurn Court Lane Christchurch BH23 6BH	Repair and replacement of three timber structures on Hurn Court, (an oriel window, atrium and cupola), undertake	Granted	02/11/20

		external repairs and replacement of three chimneys, due to decay and deterioration (amended description).		
--	--	---	--	--

Representations

6. No representations have been received for either the full planning application or for the listed building application.

Consultations

- Hurn Parish Council – no objection
- BCP Trees & Landscaping – no objection
- Historic England – advise to seek advice of conservation officer
- BCP Conservation/Heritage – support the proposals for replacement of the existing coping with man made stone coping as the existing original coping has cracked and decayed enabling water ingress.

Constraints

- Listed Buildings - 0.00m
- Flood Zone 2 (2019) - 0.00m
- FZ3a 30cc 2093 - 0.00m
- FZ3a 40cc 2133 - 0.00m
- Flood Zone 3a (2019) - 0.00m
- Sites of Special Scientific Interest - 0.00m
- SSSI Impact Risk Zone - 0.00m
- Wildlife - 0.00m
- Green Belt - 0.00m
- Heathland 5km Consultation Area - 0.00m
- Airport Safeguarding - 0.00m
- Dorset Minerals Consultation Area - 0.00m
- Tree Preservation Order - 0.00m

Planning Assessment

Site and Surroundings

7. The application site relates to Hurn Court, which is a substantial 3 - 4 storey building of grade II* listed status. Previously in use as a school, the main building was converted to 6 flats in the 1990's. The listed building description dates the earliest visible remains of the building to the end of the 16th century. The building was significantly altered and extended in the 1840's, including the addition of the current top storey. Some of the original coping is therefore likely to date from this period or earlier.

Impact upon significance of listed building (heritage asset)

8. In assessing these applications the Council shall have due regard to the statutory duty in Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 which states that "*In considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority... shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.*"
9. Section 16 of the NPPF gives further advice in relation to assessing applications in relation to Heritage Assets. Paragraph 185 includes the requirement for planning authorities to take account of the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation. Great weight is to be given to the asset's conservation (para 193) and any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset should require clear and convincing justification (para 194).
10. In assessing such applications, consideration should be given as to whether the proposals represent any harm, and if so whether the harm is substantial or less than substantial. If substantial harm, Local Planning Authorities should refuse consent unless the loss is required to achieve substantial public benefits (para. 195). Where the proposals would lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of the asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal, including securing its optimum viable use (para 196).
11. As part of ongoing maintenance works to Hurn Court, significant repairs were undertaken in spring-summer 2020 to repair plasterwork, chimneys, and replace timber windows and structures including an oriel window and atrium. Those works were granted consent in late 2020, with works on site being carried out with the advice of the conservation officer. During these works it was noted that the render and coping (capping on top) to some of the parapet walls was cracked and becoming damaged allowing water ingress. In order to prevent any further damage from water ingress, a number of areas were identified for full replacement, these areas being on the south elevation which is open to weather exposure.

12. The original coping is constructed of rolled moulded brickwork which is rendered to give the appearance of stonework. Due to the costs involved in replicating the original coping, and the potential for it to fail again particularly on the exposed south elevation, the use of a reconstituted stone coping was discussed and agreed as an acceptable alternative with the Council's conservation officer. The replacement coping (which is now in-situ) is constructed of reconstituted stone with a flat top design and therefore there is a slight difference in the appearance. However, given the varied roofscape behind the coping, this change in design is not considered to result in substantial harm to the significance of the listed building. Furthermore the use of stone rather than rendered brickwork should provide more longer lasting protection to the top of the walls. This type of coping design has also already been used in other areas of the building during previous repair works.

13. The loss of the original coping due to deterioration and replacement with new coping is considered to result in less than substantial harm to the significance of the heritage asset. However, the material and design of the replacement is considered acceptable and will provide long term protection from potential damage as a result of water ingress. It is therefore considered that the public benefits from these changes, in maintaining the building for future generations and ensuring the on-going use of the building as self-contained flats, outweighs the harm as a result of the loss of historic fabric. The development is therefore considered to comply with Part 16 of the NPPF (2019) and Policies HE1 and BE14 of the Local Plan (2014).

14. Impact on neighbouring living conditions

15. Whilst the works will result in a marginal difference in the appearance of the coping, they will not result in material harm to the visual amenities of neighbouring occupants. The works will not result in a material loss of light or privacy. The development is therefore considered to comply with Policies HE2 and H12 of the Local Plan (2014).

Summary

16. Whilst the proposal results in the loss of some historic fabric, the fabric is damaged and in need of repair or replacement. The use of man-made stone has been used elsewhere on the building and provides a more economical and viable approach to the ongoing repairs required. The minor change in the design is not considered to harm the significance of the building and should provide a better solution to protecting the upper walls of the building. The conservation officer has been consulted throughout the works on site and supports the proposals.

Planning Balance

17. The scheme is considered to result in less than substantial harm to the heritage asset. Applying the guidance in paragraph 196 of the NPPF (2019), this impact must be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where

appropriate, securing its optimum viable use. These repair works will facilitate the ongoing use of the property as self-contained flats, which is considered to be the optimum use for the building. The public benefits in this case are therefore considered to outweigh any harm to the heritage asset. The development is not considered to result in any harm to neighbouring living conditions. The proposals are therefore considered to comply with Policies HE1, HE2, H12 and KS1 of the Local Plan (2014).

RECOMMENDATION

App. No. 8/21/0131/FUL

Grant subject to conditions which are subject to alteration/addition by the Head of Planning Services provided any alteration/addition does not go to the core of the decision, subject to the following:

Condition:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans:

location and site plan sheet 01
extg and proposed coping stones sheet 02
coping stone locations sheet 03

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.

App. No. 8/21/0132/LB

Grant subject to conditions which are subject to alteration/addition by the Head of Planning Services provided any alteration/addition does not go to the core of the decision.

Condition:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans:

location and site plan sheet 01
extg and proposed coping stones sheet 02
coping stone locations sheet 03

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.

Background Papers

Case File ref: 8/21/0131/FUL & 8/21/0132/LB

NB For full details of all papers submitted with this application please refer to the relevant Public Access pages on the council's website.

The conditions set out in the report may be subject to such reasonable change as is necessary to ensure accuracy and enforceability.